



Bishop Vesey's Grammar School

Cleaning Tender Analysis Summary

Prepared by:

Michael G Neales MSc
Senior Consultant

Sam O'Sullivan
Senior Financial Analyst

The Litmus Partnership Ltd
May 2020



Purpose

To provide a concise synopsis of the key bid elements, in order to enable and aid the client in the decision-making process. This report is completed after the conclusion of an established due diligence process.

Detailed bid data is provided separately and available on the Hub.

Bidders

Tenders have been submitted from:

- Fidelis Group (Fidelis)
- Ridge Crest Cleaning Services (Ridge Crest)
- Samsic UK (Samsic)
- ServiceMaster Mercia (ServiceMaster)

Non-Compliant (NC) bids have also been received from Fidelis, Ridge Crest and Samsic.

Conditions of Tender

Bidders have been asked:

- To provide their costs net of VAT, therefore, any additional costs associated with VAT must be considered outside of this report, unless otherwise stated.
- To account for a £3,000 consultancy fee within their bid.
- To account for the National Living Wage of £8.72 within their bids.

All bidders have complied with the above conditions.

Timetable

The important dates remaining in the process are:

- | | |
|-----------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| • Bidder presentations on 14 th May 2020 | Alcatel 10-day period starting on week commencing 18 th May 2020 |
| • Contract award in June 2020 | June – July 2020 mobilisation |
| • 1 st August 2020 Contract Start | |

Financial Summary

	Fidelis	Fidelis (NC)	Ridge Crest	Ridge Crest (NC)	Samsic	Samsic (NC)	ServiceMaster
Total Sundry Expenses	£13,452	£13,159	£11,509	£11,509	£6,946	£6,946	£9,885
Sundry Expenses as a % of Operating Budget	9%	10%	8%	8%	5%	6%	7%
Total Labour	£116,681	£111,025	£122,878	£113,917	£118,126	£95,119	£120,475
Labour as a % of Operating Budget	81%	81%	81%	80%	82%	79%	84%
Total Contractor Income	£13,658	£13,004	£16,675	£16,675	£18,183	£18,784	£12,789
Fee as a % of Operating Budget	9%	9%	11%	12%	13%	16%	9%
Operating Budget	-£143,791	-£137,188	-£151,062	-£142,101	-£143,255	-£120,848	-£143,149
First Year Exceptional Costs	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£3,833

Causes of Financial Variation between Bids:

- Samsic (NC) have the lowest operating cost, due to proposing to reduce the number of employees by 5, reducing weekly hours by 42.40, coupled with only proposing to depreciate £952 of their £9,501 equipment cost within year one of the contract, and only depreciating £2,915 over the initial three year contract.
- Following clarification, Samsic have stated the remaining £6,586 equipment that is not depreciated will be covered by their equipment suppliers.
- Ridge Crest's high operating cost is due to their intention to increase the total number of employees by two, resulting in an additional 30 hours per week.
- Each of the contractors' non-compliant (NC) bids propose a reduction in the number of Cleaning Operatives, compared with their compliant bids, except in the case of Ridge Crest where the hours worked by the existing employees have been reduced.
- All bidders have included the consultancy fee of £3,000 within their bids. Fidelis have included the fee within their sundry expenses, while Ridge Crest and Samsic have included the fee within their management fees. ServiceMaster has included the fee within their First Year Exceptional Costs, along with £833 of mobilisation costs.
- Fidelis and ServiceMaster are the only contractors to include a cost for disposables within their bids.
- Fidelis have stated that they would offer a 3% discount to the operating costs stated above, for early payment of invoices. This would reduce their year one compliant and non-compliant costs by £4,314 and £4,116 respectively.

Potential Risks and Areas Requiring Further Clarification:

- Samsic's financial rationale states that they are guaranteeing an annual cost of £136,310 and £113,903 for their compliant and non-compliant bids respectively, despite the annual cost within their financial submission being £6,946 higher. We queried this with the bidder who have stated the cost in their financial rationale and financial submission are both correct, despite these figures not reconciling. Please note that we have used their financial submission within the analysis, but recommend further clarification is sought regarding Samsic's financial offer.
- Ridge Crest have not provided an hourly rate for contract variations within their pricing schedule. We had requested this from the contractor, but at the time of producing the report, no response has been received.

Analyst Adjustments to Bids:

- Samsic's overhead and profit costs have been moved from labour costs to management fee, for comparability.

Financial Snapshot

	Current Position	Fidelis	Fidelis (NC)	Ridge Crest	Ridge Crest (NC)	Samsic	Samsic (NC)	ServiceMaster	
Cost of Service	Annual Cost	-	£143,791	£137,188	£151,062	£142,101	£143,255	£120,848	£143,149
	Rank	-	6	2	7	3	5	1	4
	Cost per Square Metre	-	£18.29	£17.45	£19.21	£18.07	£18.22	£15.37	£18.21
	Monthly Cost	-	£11,983	£11,432	£12,589	£11,842	£11,938	£10,071	£11,929
KPIs	Sundry Expenses as a % of Annual Cost	-	9%	10%	8%	8%	5%	6%	7%
	Labour as a % of Annual Cost	-	81%	81%	81%	80%	82%	79%	84%
	Management Fee as a % of Annual Cost	-	9%	9%	11%	12%	13%	16%	9%
Labour Hours	Total Weekly Supervisor Hours	37.50	37.50	37.50	37.50	17.50	37.50	37.50	37.50
	Total Weekly Cleaning Hours	197.50	197.50	186.25	227.50	240.00	197.50	155.10	197.50
	Total Weekly Labour Hours	235.00	235.00	223.75	265.00	257.50	235.00	192.60	235.00
	Total Annual Labour Hours	-	9,016.95	8,585.29	11,771.77	10,997.50	10,575.00	8,667.00	10,778.18
	General Hourly Rate	£8.21	£8.72	£8.72	£8.72	£8.72	£8.72	£8.72	£8.72
	Cost per Labour Hours	-	£15.95	£15.98	£12.83	£12.92	£13.55	£13.94	£13.28
Labour Weeks	Worked Weeks - Term Time and Periodic	-	38.37	38.37	39.10 - 46.80	38.00 - 43.00	45.00	45.00	43.00 - 46.54
	Paid Holiday Weeks	-	4.63	4.63	4.60 - 5.60	4.70 - 5.20	4.00	4.00	4.60 - 5.60
	Total Paid Weeks per Annum	43.00-52.14	43.00	43.00	43.71 - 52.10	42.70 - 48.20	49.00	49.00	47.60 - 52.14
Equipment	Total Cost (Over Contractual Term)	-	£2,835	£2,835	£17,983	£17,983	£9,501	£9,501	£0
	Annual Cost	-	£945	£945	£5,994	£5,994	£952	£952	£0

Comparing KPI's

- Samsic have only depreciated £952 of their £9,501 equipment within year one of the contract, and have only depreciated £2,915 over the initial three year contract term. The bidder has stated that the remaining £6,586 will be covered by their equipment suppliers.
- Fidelis and Ridge Crest have depreciated their equipment equally over the initial three year contract term.
- ServiceMaster have proposed not to buy the equipment but to hire it at a cost of £2,900 per annum.

Labour Structure Summary

The below tables outline any changes to the current TUPE structure based on number of positions, the total weekly hours, the basic hourly rate and the basic pay. The basic hourly rate is an average of all the staff members in the same position. For the range please see the 'General Hourly Rate' in the Financial Snapshot.

		TUPE			Fidelis				Fidelis (NC)				
		Cleaning Operative	Supervisor	Total	Cleaning Operative	Housekeeper	Supervisor	Total	Cleaning Operative	Housekeeper	Supervisor	Cleaning Manager	Total
Bishop Vesey's Grammar School	Positions	14	1	15	13	1	1	15	12	1	1	1	15
	Total weekly hours	197.50	37.50	235.00	160.00	37.50	37.50	235.00	148.75	37.50	17.50	20.00	223.75
	Basic hourly rate	£8.21	£8.21		£8.72	£8.72	£8.89		£8.72	£8.72	£9.12	£9.72	
	Basic pay	£81,167	£16,053	£97,220	£59,994	£14,061	£14,335	£88,390	£55,775	£14,061	£6,863	£8,359	£85,058

		TUPE			Ridge Crest				Ridge Crest (NC)			
		Cleaning Operative	Supervisor	Total	Cleaning Operative	Janitor	Supervisor	Total	Cleaning Operative	Janitor	Supervisor	Total
Bishop Vesey's Grammar School	Positions	14	1	15	15	1	1	17	15	1	1	17
	Total weekly hours	197.50	37.50	235.00	190.00	37.50	37.50	265.00	225.00	15.00	17.50	257.50
	Basic hourly rate	£8.21	£8.21		£8.72	£8.72	£9.50		£8.72	£8.72	£12.00	
	Basic pay	£81,167	£16,053	£97,220	£80,830	£17,037	£18,561	£116,428	£94,568	£5,585	£10,122	£110,276

		TUPE			Samsic				Samsic (NC)			
		Cleaning Operative	Supervisor	Total	Cleaning Operative	Assistant Supervisor	Supervisor	Total	Cleaning Operative	Assistant Supervisor	Supervisor	Total
Bishop Vesey's Grammar School	Positions	14	1	15	13	1	1	15	8	1	1	10
	Total weekly hours	197.50	37.50	235.00	160.00	37.50	37.50	235.00	117.60	37.50	37.50	192.60
	Basic hourly rate	£8.21	£8.21		£8.72	£8.90	£9.10		£8.72	£8.90	£9.10	
	Basic pay	£81,167	£16,053	£97,220	£68,365	£16,354	£16,721	£101,440	£50,248	£16,354	£16,721	£83,323

		TUPE			ServiceMaster		
		Cleaning Operative	Supervisor	Total	Cleaning Operative	Supervisor	Total
Bishop Vesey's Grammar School	Positions	14	1	15	14	1	15
	Total weekly hours	197.50	37.50	235.00	197.50	37.50	235.00
	Basic hourly rate	£8.21	£8.21		£8.72	£8.90	
	Basic pay	£81,167	£16,053	£97,220	£87,985	£17,403	£105,388

Increased against TUPE

Decreased against TUPE

Potential Staff Position Changes:

- All bidders have complied with the National Living Wage of £8.72.
- Fidelis have clarified the lower paid weeks in the bid has been based on what they understand is currently worked, rather than the paid weeks stated within the TUPE information provided.

Pension Costs:

- The TUPE information provided shows two employees receiving NEST pension contributions of 4%
 - Fidelis have included 4% contributions for the two employees, with their compliant bid also including a 2% contribution for the Supervisor.
 - Ridge Crest have reduced the contributions of the two employees to 2%.
 - Ridge Crest (NC) have included a 1% contribution for the Supervisor, and 0.2% contributions for all other employees.
 - Samsic have included 2% contributions for all employees.
 - ServiceMaster have proposed to reduce the contributions of the two employees to 2%.

Contract Variations

The below table compares each bidder's costs for out of hours labour, which have been taken from their submitted pricing schedule.

	Fidelis	Fidelis (NC)	Ridge Crest	Ridge Crest (NC)	Samsic	Samsic (NC)	ServiceMaster
Hourly Rate (inc in costs)	£8.73	£8.81	-	-	£12.34	£12.34	£10.73
Miscellaneous Costs	£1.95	£2.00	-	-	£0.00	£0.00	£0.84
Management Fee	£1.19	£1.20	-	-	£0.00	£0.00	£0.35
Total Cost per Hour per Person	£11.87	£12.01	-	-	£12.34	£12.34	£11.92

Notes:

- Ridge Crest have not submitted a cost for contract variations, within either their pricing schedule or bidder response document.
- Fidelis have offered a 3% discount on their submitted contract variation rates, for early payment of invoices.

Qualitative Assessment

Marking Matrix ~ Bishop Vesey's Grammar School

Cleaning Tender Evaluation Criteria



Category	Evaluation Criteria	% Weighting	Maximum Weighted Score	Contractor 1		Contractor 2		Contractor 3		Contractor 4		Contractor 5		Contractor 6	
				Score	Weighted										
1. Cleaning Service Delivery	a. Cleaning Standards	7.5%	30		0		0		0		0		0		0
	b. Cleaning Equipment	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
	c. Safe Working Practices	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
Cleaning Service Delivery Scoring		12.5%	50	0%	0										
2. Management	a. Mobilisation	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
	b. Management and Reporting	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
Management Scoring		5.0%	20	0%	0										
3. People	a. Staffing Rationale	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
	b. Staff Development	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
People Scoring		5.0%	20	0%	0										
4. Service Development	a. Service Innovation	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
	b. Technical Input and Continuous Development	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
Service Development Scoring		5.0%	20	0%	0										
5. Finance	a. Financial Competitiveness	62.5%	250		0		0		0		0		0		0
	b. Financial Rationale	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
Finance Scoring		65.0%	260	0%	0										
6. Compliance and Cultural Fit	a. Compliance with the Specification and Contract Agreement	2.5%	10		0		0		0		0		0		0
	b. Cultural Fit	5.0%	20		0		0		0		0		0		0
Contractor Compliance and Cultural Fit Scoring		7.5%	30	0%	0										
Scoring Guide		100.00%	400	0%	0										

0 = fails to meet any expectations or no answer given
 1 = meets some expectations
 2 = meets most expectations
 3 = meets expectations
 4 = meets expectations and gives example/s of added value

Detailed P&L for Year 1

	Fidelis	Fidelis (NC)	Ridge Crest	Ridge Crest (NC)	Samsic	Samsic (NC)	ServiceMaster
Disposables	£1,683	£1,602	£0	£0	£0	£0	£1,200
Cleaning Materials	£3,366	£3,203	£4,545	£4,545	£3,238	£3,238	£4,290
Deep Cleaning	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Pest Control	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Uniforms & Protective Clothing	£780	£780	£340	£340	£2,096	£2,096	£875
DBS Checks	£900	£900	£510	£510	£660	£660	£345
Telephone / Mobile Costs	£0	£0	£120	£120	£0	£0	£275
Window Cleaning (External)	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Equipment Hire	£1,768	£1,768	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Procurement Fee	£3,000	£3,000	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Insurance	£1,010	£961	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Machine Hire	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£2,900
Equipment Cost per Annum	£945	£945	£5,994	£5,994	£952	£952	£0
Total Sundry Expenses	£13,452	£13,159	£11,509	£11,509	£6,946	£6,946	£9,885
Net Wage Cost	£88,390	£85,058	£116,428	£110,276	£101,440	£83,323	£105,388
Employers NI Contributions	£1,915	£1,002	£2,482	£273	£13,829	£9,389	£2,330
Employers Pension Contributions	£1,164	£872	£772	£378	£2,153	£1,768	£716
Holiday Relief Cover Costs	£9,519	£9,160	£0	£0	£227	£168	£9,283
Sickness Relief Cover Costs	£1,010	£961	£1,164	£1,104	£38	£31	£2,007
Pay Award Annual Value	£0	£0	£2,033	£1,886	£0	£0	£750
Supervisor/ Contracts Management	£4,040	£4,805	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Training & Quality	£7,069	£3,844	£0	£0	£440	£440	£0
Payroll, Admin & Timegate	£3,574	£5,324	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Total Labour	£116,681	£111,025	£122,878	£113,917	£118,126	£95,119	£120,475
Management Fee	£13,658	£13,004	£16,675	£16,675	£18,183	£18,784	£12,789
Total Contractor Income	£13,658	£13,004	£16,675	£16,675	£18,183	£18,784	£12,789
Total Overhead Costs	£143,791	£137,188	£151,062	£142,101	£143,255	£120,848	£143,149
Operating Budget	-£143,791	-£137,188	-£151,062	-£142,101	-£143,255	-£120,848	-£143,149
First Year Exceptional Costs	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	£3,833

Bidder	Comment	Response